Policies to Boost Adult Postsecondary Education Credential Attainment in Michigan

Spring 2019

Applied Policy Seminar

Gerald R. Ford School of Public Policy, University of Michigan
### Table of Contents

**INTRODUCTION**

**WHITMER INITIATIVES OVERVIEW**

**STATE POLICIES: BEST PRACTICES**
- Tennessee
- Indiana
- Mississippi

**RELATED POLICY TOPICS**
- College Remediation
- Performance-Based Funding
- Adult Basic Education
- Data as a Tool for Accountability

**REFERENCES**
Introduction

Purpose of Report
The purpose of this report is to inform the Detroit Regional Chamber and other Michigan business organizations of policy topics related to boosting post-secondary education credential attainment among Michigan’s workforce. The report is composed of research conducted during the winter and spring of 2019 to support the Detroit Regional Chamber’s efforts to build coalition support around the post-secondary education initiatives announced during Governor Whitmer’s first state of the state address on February 12, 2019. Research included on specific policy topics is intended to help business leaders understand potential future policy discussions around Governor Whitmer’s post-secondary education agenda. Specifically, the report includes research on relevant policies in states considered as leaders in the space as well policy topics that may be relevant as work progresses surrounding the details of Whitmer’s initiatives.

Timeline of Report
On February 12th, 2019, Governor Whitmer, in her first state of the state address announced the goal of increasing the portion of Michiganders with a postsecondary credential to 60% percent by 2030. As part of this goal, Governor Whitmer also announced the creation of both the Michigan Reconnect program for adults (25+) and the Michigan Opportunity Scholarship for graduating high school students. On March 28, 2019, the Detroit Regional Chamber, Business Leaders for Michigan, the Grand Rapids Chamber, and the Small Business Association of Michigan announced their support for the initiatives and published a set of principles “needed to ensure effectiveness as the...programs are developed and negotiated within the legislative process.”iii The Michigan Chamber of Commerce has pledged “full, unequivocal” backing of the initiatives.

Adult Postsecondary Education Credential Attainment: State of the Issue
Post-secondary education credentials include 4-year university degrees, 2-year associate degrees, and high value career or technical certificates and credentials. Michigan has historically lagged in efforts to boost post-secondary education credential attainment and up until Governor Gretchen Whitmer’s first state of the state address in February of 2019, Michigan was one of only seven states to not have a formal state-led goal to increase credential attainment. Despite this lack of action, increasing the portion of Michigan’s workforce with a post-secondary education credential is vital to the state’s economic future. By 2020, 65% of all US jobs will require a credential, but currently only 44% of Michigan residents hold a credential. Michigan already lacks a sufficiently skilled workforce and businesses will continue to struggle to bridge the existing talent gap as it will only worsen if action is not taken by policymakers and business leaders. The Michigan Department of Technology, Management, and Budget predicts the state will experience a shortage of more than 811,000 jobs through 2024 in information technology and computer science, health care, manufacturing, and other industries.iii Although many factors
contribute, cost has remained a primary inhibitor for many Michiganders seeking to obtain a credential. Michigan ranks sixth for the share of college costs paid by students, which has increased to 70% in 2017 from 41% in 2000. In order to increase the portion of Michiganders with credentials and bridge the labor market skills gap, Michigan must not only maintain but dramatically increase current attainment rates (additional information on Michigan’s labor market challenges can be found in the Michigan Total Talent Report).

Whitmer Initiatives Overview

Michigan Reconnect
The Michigan Reconnect program will provide funding for Michigan adults (25+) to receive an in-demand industry certificate or associate degree, by covering all tuition costs and mandatory fees not covered by federal Pell Grants. The program will be available to Michigan residents in the summer of 2019. It is estimated that Michigan Reconnect will benefit 51,000 students and cost the state $110 million over two years. The program was introduced to the legislature on April 16th, 2019. iv

Michigan Opportunity Scholarship
The Michigan Opportunity Scholarship would grant students graduating from high school in 2020 two funding opportunities for their postsecondary education. Students will have the option to receive either three years or 60 credit hours of tuition funding at a community college, with no means testing, or two years of a $2,500 annual scholarship to enroll at a four-year college or university. Both options would cover cost of tuition and mandatory fees not provided by federal Pell Grants. The scholarship is intended to begin during the fiscal year starting in October 2020 and students attending community college will receive funding that fall. In the program’s first year, it is estimated to cost $108 million by providing funding for more than 44,000 students. It is estimated the program will cost $190 million and benefit 76,000 students in its second year as enrollment grows.
State Policies: Best Practices

Introduction
Prior to the state of the state address and before the Governor announced she would be modelling her initiatives after successful programs in Tennessee, the Detroit Chamber commissioned the authors to research best practices in the following states. This information was intended to inform the Chamber on policies that may have been considered by the administration prior to the Governor’s announcement. The Comparative Grid attachment also includes Florida and Nevada.

Tennessee

Program Summary
Tennessee has recently implemented two programs targeted at boosting postsecondary education credential attainment to 55 percent of adults by 2025.\(^\text{v}\) Tennessee Promise, which began in 2014, offers residents two years of tuition-free community or technical college for recent high school graduates. In 2018, the state implemented Tennessee Reconnect to expand the program to all adults with a high school diploma. Under the program, the state pays the cost of tuition that is not covered through federal Pell grants. The programs have cost the state about $45 million annually which is completely covered by Tennessee’s lottery reserve fund.

Political Success
The program has successfully boosted graduation rates and grown in popularity each year. Additionally, Tennessee leads the US in completion rates of the application for federal student aid—a key indicator of likely college enrollment.\(^\text{vi}\) When the program was expanded in 2014, 8,000 adults were expected to apply. But in fact, more than 33,000 adults applied from which 15,000 enrolled in the first semester. The program was implemented under Republican governor, Bill Haslam, who successfully branded it as a workforce development program and a “ladder to the middle class.” Its political success in a thoroughly red state is attributed to several key components of the program. First, its funding through the lottery reserve fund requires no new taxes to cover the cost of the program. Second, eligibility requires community service and does not discriminate based on income which prevents the program from being viewed as an entitlement program for low-income adults.

Criticism
The primary criticism is that the program distributes state funds inequitably. Because the program provides the ‘last dollar’ of tuition costs that are not covered by Pell grants, higher-income students receive little federal aid and, therefore, receive more state funding relative to lower-income residents who qualify for federal aid. A study conducted by the Institute for Higher Education Policy found that of the half of students who receive no state funding, 98 percent are Pell grant recipients.\(^\text{vii}\) In contrast, of the half of students who receive state funding, only 3 percent are eligible for Pell grants. Thus, funds that should be allocated to low-income students are instead entitled to higher-income students who are more likely to be able to cover tuition costs independently.
Indiana

Summary
Indiana has implemented a few different programs to tackle the problem of improving adult education attainment and workforce development. One of the staple programs of Indiana is Next Level Jobs. This program helps adults with a high school diploma or an equivalent pay for certificates in 5 fields deemed high demand sectors. Those sectors are Advanced Manufacturing, Building and Construction, Health & Life Sciences, IT and Business Services, and Transportation and Logistics. There are also incentives for employers. Employers are reimbursed for employees trained, up to $5,000 per employee and up to $50,000 per employer. Next Level Funds is funded through state grants. Another successful program in Indiana is WorkINdiana. This program offers aid to adults who are looking to receive certificates in designated growth industries. It is funded through federal grant aid in the Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act.

Political Success
The Next Level Jobs program has been met with praise. With more than 4,000 individuals enrolled in certificate programs, Next Level Jobs has done a lot to reduce the training gap needed to fill many of the growth sectors in Indiana. With more than $5 million being reimbursed to employers, the program has been touted as a shining example of workforce development done right. Last year, Governor Holcomb helped expand the program with more funds and larger reimbursements for employers.

Criticism
There has been little pushback from opponents on the Next Level Jobs initiative. The only critique is that it does not do enough to close the gap needed by employers. Much of the attention in the state has been drawn to teacher pay and hate crimes in the state.
Mississippi

Program Summary
Launched at the start of the 2017-2018 school year, Complete 2 Compete (C2C) is Mississippi’s statewide postsecondary education attainment initiative, empowering those who started but did not finish college to obtain their associate’s or bachelor’s degree. For adult learners 21 years of age who have been out of college for at least 24 consecutive months, C2C provides a no-cost application that enables adult learners to assess prior credits earned and matches learners with a C2C coach and the institution offering the best pathway to obtain a degree.xv

The need for C2C arose in 2017 as Mississippi evaluated postsecondary education attainment and ways for the state to both attract employers and retain graduating student talent. As of August 2017: 2,400 Mississippians were eligible to earn a bachelor’s degree with no additional coursework, 28,000 Mississippians were eligible to earn an associate degree with no additional coursework, and over 100,000 Mississippians could earn either a bachelor’s degree or an associate degree with minimal additional coursework.xvi First-year results have been encouraging. As of October 2018, adult learners earned 486 degrees - 323 associate degrees and 163 Bachelor’s degrees. Nearly 39,000 people have visited the C2C website, yielding 13,000 applications and 858 enrollees in C2C.xvii

C2C funding comes from diversified sources, including general funds, the Mississippi Department of Human Services (MDHS), the Mississippi Department of Employment Security (MDES), and charitable donations.xviii One significant donation was the $3.5 million received from the W.K. Kellogg Foundation, which directly funds the C2C “Tuition Assistance Grant”. The C2C grant is intended to assist adult learners pay prior student debt, alleviate the cost of new tuition, and cover ancillary expenses such as textbook costs. Though this specific donation provided 7,000 adult learners with a one-time grant of $500 each (hence the $3.5 million sum), the C2C grant is awarded to students each qualifying semester for which they are enrolled in college (5).

Political Success
C2C has been politically successful in Mississippi, due to the broad-based buy-in across state organizations. The Mississippi Institutions of Higher Learning (oversight of Mississippi’s eight public higher-learning institutions) and the Mississippi Community College Board (oversight of Mississippi’s fifteen community colleges) partnered to actively identify potential students and create services catered to adult learners. The administration and its agencies have offered continued public support, including Governor Phil Bryant, MDHS, and MDES.xix

Criticism
The program has only completed one year, limiting the opportunities for detailed evaluation. However, Mississippi is interested in assessing how family income, employer investment in Mississippi, and retention of graduating students change as a result of the program.
Related Policy Topics

Research on the following topics – college remediation, performance-based funding, adult basic education, and data as a tool for accountability – was commissioned to inform the Chamber and representatives from other business organizations of policy topics that may arise in negotiations over the Governor’s initiatives.

College Remediation

Background – College Remediation in Michigan Remains a Concern

Part of the broad education challenge facing Michigan is that recent high school graduates are academically unprepared for postsecondary education. The percentages in Table 1 display, by year, the number of high school graduates who took at least one remedial course after enrolling in a Michigan public college or university the year after high school graduation, divided by the total number of high school graduates who enrolled in a Michigan public college or university that year. For example, in academic year 2015-2016, 20% of new Michigan public college or university students required at least one remedial course at community college; the number rises to 27% including all postsecondary institutions. Particularly a problem at the community college level, students in remedial courses drop out before taking actual credit-bearing college courses. In 2012, Larry Good, chairman of the Corporation for a Skilled Workforce, noted, “Most kids who go in to remedial programs don’t get out of them. It becomes a dead-end.” At the time, only 15% of incoming community college students who started out in remedial classes would complete their associate degree, a rate that was sixth-worst nationally. In 2017, Phil Power, founder and chairman of the Center for Michigan, agreed with Mr. Good’s assessment. Mr. Power noted, “Having to repeat basic material badly taught is both expensive and frustrating for schools, colleges, students and families.” Mr. Power attributed the problem to a “complex and inefficient system of education we have allowed to come about in Michigan over the years, the result in large part of our widespread erosion of political will to make the tough decisions, accountability-free management, and passive-aggressive inertia”.

Table 1 – Percentage of New Students Enrolled in a Michigan Public Postsecondary Institution Who Required Remediation, by College Type

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Academic Year</th>
<th>Community College</th>
<th>Other</th>
<th>All</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>Math</td>
<td>Reading</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015-16</td>
<td>20.0%</td>
<td>15.0%</td>
<td>6.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014-15</td>
<td>20.8%</td>
<td>15.9%</td>
<td>6.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013-14</td>
<td>19.6%</td>
<td>14.6%</td>
<td>5.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012-13</td>
<td>19.8%</td>
<td>14.6%</td>
<td>6.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011-12</td>
<td>19.8%</td>
<td>14.8%</td>
<td>6.3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Despite the percentages in Table 1 showing no improvement in the last five years, there is localized success in Michigan that could offer a broader blueprint. In spring 2017, Grand Rapids Community College shared that fewer and fewer of its students require remedial courses; in the
fall 2016 semester, only 40.8% of its students required one or more remedial courses, a 12 percentage-point improvement versus 2010. The formula for its success included several factors:

- The Academics Foundations Program: the college’s main program for English, math, reading, and college readiness remediation.
- The Fast Track Program: three-week course in writing, reading, and math to help students test out of remedial courses, or be successful in those courses.
- Integrated reading/writing course, co-requisites, and math for non-STEM majors.

Although Grand Rapids Community College has had success, innovative approaches pioneered in other states’ models warrant discussion.

**Co-Requisite Remediation is a Proven Solution**

Tennessee was an early indicator of the success of co-requisite remediation, a developmental education approach pairing placement in credit-bearing college courses with remedial academic support. In fall 2015, Tennessee launched co-requisite remediation at the state’s 13 public community colleges. The results were noteworthy: after policy implementation, 51% of students in a co-requisite math course in fall 2015 passed the college-level course, compared to 12% of students who began in a remediation course and completed a credit-bearing math class within an academic year in 2012. For writing, 59% of students in the co-requisite course passed, compared to 31% percent who began in a traditional remediation course and completed a credit-bearing writing course in 2012. Equally noteworthy is that Tennessee implemented the program without providing additional resources to the community colleges to transition to co-requisite remediation. The Board of Regents, who oversees the community college system, recognized that while cost per student would increase, the cost per successful graduate – what policymakers truly care about – decreases dramatically as more students graduate and efficiency improves.

Using a term coined by Complete College America, Tennessee is broadly considered one of the five “Bridge Builders” – states that successfully transitioned to co-requisite remediation and serve as a model for others, briefly discussing the remaining four:

- **Georgia** – previously, only 21% of remedial students completed the related credit-bearing course in two years. Now, the state requires that at least half of remedial students must be immediately placed in the co-requisite model; the rest take a standalone course the first semester, then a co-requisite course the second semester. Completion rates for Math and English have more than tripled.
- **West Virginia** – previously, only 14% of community college students placed in remedial math took the related credit-bearing course within two years of the remedial course. State created a Developmental Education Task Force, composed of faculty members, who led policy research and implementation. One year after implementation, Math success rates climbed to 62%; English success rates climbed to 68%.
- **Indiana** – created separate steering teams for English and Math. Indiana also created three pathways for Math remediation: Quantitative Reasoning for non-STEM majors, College Algebra as the traditional pathway, and Applied Technical Math for STEM majors. Math success rates climbed to 64%; English success rates climbed to 55%.
- **Colorado** – previously, only 31% of community college students placed in remedial courses finished the credit-bearing course in two years. Colorado used a mixed model of standalone and co-requisite remediation, based on where students score on the placement
assessment. Now, 64% of remedial students complete the related credit-bearing course in one year.

Complete College America blueprints six pillars to any state seeking to launch co-requisite remediation, and New America highlights four tools to scale co-requisite remediation from pilot to full implementation, available at the links under “References”.

**High School Remediation Doesn’t “Move the Needle” in a Co-Requisite Environment**

The Tennessee Seamless Alignment and Integrated Learning Support program (SAILS), is the state’s initiative moving college math remediation to high school. According to a 2018 study by Harvard University’s Center for Education Policy Research, the SAILS program results have been mixed:

- The negative: the SAILS program doesn’t improve math skills. Of the students who, after SAILS, enrolled in credit-bearing college math, approximately half passed the course. The college course passing rates were not higher than non-SAILS participants who were just above the cutoff for placement in SAILS. Additionally, there was no effect on the total number of credits students completed by the end of their second college year.
- The positive: students who participated in SAILS were 29 percentage points more likely to enroll in credit-bearing college math during their first year of community college. Secondly, Tennessee high schools have a four-year math requirement, so there is no additional cost to colleges or high schools for remediation in a student’s senior year. Finally, for students in SAILS compared to their non-SAILS peers, their perception of math’s usefulness improved – they were 6.5 percentage points more likely to think math was useful, 10 percentage points more likely to indicate feeling better prepared, and 6 percentage points more likely to indicate interest in math.

**Conclusion**

If Michigan would like to increase the success of remediation courses in postsecondary education, several pioneering states have evidenced that co-requisite remediation is a proven solution. While more expensive on a per-student basis, co-requisite remediation dramatically increases student success rates, and is therefore more efficient on a per-graduate basis. While high school remediation is innovative, so far it has not evidenced an incremental effect if introduced into an established co-requisite environment.
Performance-Based Funding

National Prevalence of Performance Based-Funding
Performance-based funding (PBF) ties state funding to specific outcomes for higher education institutions. By tying funding to metrics such as graduation and retention rates, time to degree, and enrollment of underrepresented students, PBF policies are intended to align incentives with desired outcomes and, therefore, allocate funding to the most cost-efficient institutions. PBF is an alternative to block grants and enrollment-tied funding, which is the norm. In 2018, 37 states had implemented some form of PBF. While five states—Ohio, North Dakota, Nevada, Tennessee, and Mississippi—allocate more than 50 percent of higher education funding through PBF policies, the majority of states (21) allocate less than 10 percent (see figure 1).xxx PBF models are either based on formulas, which determine funding levels based on a combination of weighted indicators or based on target/recapture which determine funding levels based on institutions ability to attain specific levels of relevant metrics. The popularity of PBF funding has varied since the 1980’s but has increased in recent years.

Performance-Based Funding in Michigan Higher Education
PBF for 4-year MI universities began with the 2012/13 annual budget. However, PBF levels have been criticized as insufficient to incentivize institutions to follow state goals and some have intentionally forgone PBF opportunities, rather than adhering to eligibility criteria. Although the allocation model is complicated (see figure 2), PBF generally makes up less than 3% of funding allocated to higher education institutions and only applies to annual budget increases.xxxi 50% of annual budget increases are allocated to institutions’ proportional share of total operations funding while the remaining 50% is allocated based on performance on established metrics. For 2017/18, MI institutions received $28 million in performance-based funds. However, most institutions received a trivial amount relative to their overall budget (e.g. .78% of NMU annual revenue).

State of Research
Evaluations of the effectiveness of PBF policies have primarily produced mixed and negative results, despite consistent political support in many states. The most recent meta-analysis indicated PBF policies do not produce statistically significant effects on completion rates and access for underrepresented students.xxxii However, researchers do emphasize the difficulty of evaluating policies across diverse state and institutional contexts and acknowledge that many PBF policies may lack the financial significance to incentivize momentous change.xxxiii

Best Practices
Research in states where a majority of higher education funding is performance-based has highlighted positive effects, but generally on narrow outcomes.xxxiv For instance, in Tennessee, where 85% of higher education funding has been performance-based since 2011, PBF was found to have improved a range of outcomes for full time students.xxxv Tennessee’s success has also been credited to the inclusion of PBF within other major statewide education reforms and the Tennessee Higher Education Commission’s power to determine the details of the model.xxxvi
Figure 1
State Funding Ratios: outcome/performance-based, vs. non PBF

Figure 2:
Michigan State Budget Higher Education PBF Formula

Source: xxxviii
Adult Basic Education

Current State in Michigan

Over 212,000 Michigan adults past typical college age (25-44), approximately 10 percent of that entire population, lack a high school diploma or GED, but less than 7 percent are enrolled in any adult education programs. Funding for such programs has declined over the past decade by around $2 million dollars. With more than 37 percent of jobs in Michigan requiring “middle skills” by 2020, there will be a shortage of adults with the requisite skills to fill those jobs, or even get the training needed to fill those jobs. In addition to a deficit of working aged adults with at least a GED level education, there is another problem Michigan is facing, which is those working aged adults who struggle to master proficiency of the English language. There is nearly 250,000 Michigan residents who self-report to speak English less than “very well”. Immigrant workers are projected to account for approximately 90 percent of workforce growth by 2030, and with such stark employment numbers for those with limited-English skills (proficient English speakers with no postsecondary education earn 39 percent more than those who are not) there would be high benefits for investment in English proficiency programs.

Moving Forward

There are a few programs that may help reverse the problem Michigan is faced with. The first idea, proposed by the Michigan League for Public Policy, is to encourage these programs in non-traditional settings such as community colleges, workplaces, or sites that can handle child-care. Additionally, a US Department of Education funded paper suggested there would be added benefit for community colleges and school districts to cooperate together in order to save costs when teaching remedial courses. Washington State has integrated their ABE with preparation for credit bearing courses. Washington State had had success increasing GED test taking by approximately 8 percent. Another valuable component cited is providing well-funded support services such as effective career counseling, child-care, and college counseling services. These programs have been tried at the community college level, but not yet with ABE, and would require adjustments in implementation. Finally, the most important component cited in most literature is the connection with career pathways. With most adults entering these programs, their key motivation is securing higher pay and more stable work. Thus, a robust career pathways program targeted at those ABE enrollees would provide much needed guidance and motivation.
Data as a Tool for Accountability

With the demand for post-secondary education becoming greater with every year, the need to judge the success of those institutions providing the education becomes paramount. With the large amount of data gathered from universities, a program targeted at measuring success of students is possible. The Census Bureau teamed up with the University of Texas to build a model outcomes for all their programs. This would allow for UT to see how well students entering programs fare both during the program as well as after completion. As tantalizing as this kind of data can be both to universities as well as prospective students, there is a fair amount of pushback for the use of this kind of data. Many see the growth of these data analytics as a possible intrusion of privacy into citizens’ lives. Although many states collect much of the data mentioned, few states mandate universities to report on or release these numbers.


xiii Kara Larson, Cristina Gaeta, and Lou Sager, GED test changes and attainment: Overview of 2014 GED test changes and attainment in Washington State, August 2016


# SIDE-BY-SIDE COMPARISON of STATE PROGRAMS RELATED to ADULT POSTSECONDARY EDUCATION ATTAINMENT
Prepared for Melanie D’Evelyn, Detroit Drives Degrees, Detroit Regional Chamber

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STATE</th>
<th>PROGRAM DESCRIPTIONS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **MICHIGAN** | **PROGRAMS (MI):**  
- Michigan’s programs are targeted at boosting postsecondary education credential attainment to 60 percent of adults by 2030:  
- Michigan Reconnect - trains adults seeking an in-demand industry certificate or associate degree, as a path to up-skill. |
| **TENNESSEE** | **PROGRAMS (TN):**  
- Tennessee’s programs are targeted at boosting postsecondary education credential attainment to 55 percent of adults by 2025:  
- Tennessee Reconnect - for all adults with a high school diploma, the program offers two years of tuition-free community or technical college. Launched Fall 2018. |
| **FLORIDA** | **PROGRAMS (FL):**  
- Florida’s program is targeted at boosting postsecondary education credential attainment to 55 percent of adults by 2025:  
- Complete Florida - helps adults who started college, but did not finish, obtain their certificate, associate degree, or bachelor’s degree. All programs offered through Complete Florida are |
| **INDIANA** | **PROGRAMS (IN):**  
- Indiana’s programs are targeted at boosting postsecondary education credential attainment to 60 percent of adults by 2025:  
- Next Level Jobs (NLJ) helps adults with a high school diploma or an equivalent pay for certificates in 5 fields deemed high demand sectors. Launched |
| **MISSISSIPPI** | **PROGRAMS (MS):**  
- Mississippi’s program is targeting at boosting postsecondary education credential attainment to the national average by 2025:  
- Complete 2 Compete (C2C) is a statewide postsecondary education attainment initiative for students who started but did not finish college (MS has disproportionately high |
| **NEVADA** | **PROGRAMS (NV):**  
- Nevada’s programs are targeting at boosting postsecondary credential attainment to 60 percent of adults by 2020:  
- Silver State Works - employers can get up to $2,000 per employee in incentive reimbursements or training allowances for new hires. Launched 2011. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Most clear connection is for Michigan Reconnect, where the program will connect businesses to qualified candidates.</td>
<td>Reconnect website provides a portal to &quot;Launch My Career Tennessee&quot;. After students select their preferences in major, school, job, and industry, the portal allows students to view</td>
<td>Complete Florida actively requests partnership from the business community. Complete Florida provides &quot;needs assessments&quot; to companies, to identify training needs and</td>
<td>Through the NLJ Employer Training Grant, employers who train, hire, and retain new or incumbent workers to fill in-demand positions within recognized job fields are reimbursed</td>
<td>C2C instead leverages high degree of institutional support and coordination-cooperation between the Mississippi Institutions of Higher Learning (oversight of numbers) to obtain their Associate’s or bachelor’s degree. Adult learners must be 21 years of age and out of college for at least 24 consecutive months. Launched August 2017.</td>
<td>Highly pro-business: cooperation ensures current degree programs provide the correct education and training for in-demand jobs and strives to create more and new degree programs to fulfill</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**MI Opportunity Scholarship (for graduating high school students not pursuing a four-year college or university) - two years debt-free community college, available Fall 2020. Announced February 2019.**

100% online, though students may choose to take a course on campus at one of the partner institutions. Founded by the state legislature in 2013. Also, within Complete Florida is Complete Florida Military, for active duty service members, National Guard/Reserve and veterans, as well as their families. They do not have to have started college in order to qualify. Launched in 2015.

**Tennessee Promise - predecessor to Reconnect for recent high school graduates. Launched 2014.**

100% online, though students may choose to take a course on campus at one of the partner institutions. Founded by the state legislature in 2013. Also, within Complete Florida is Complete Florida Military, for active duty service members, National Guard/Reserve and veterans, as well as their families. They do not have to have started college in order to qualify. Launched in 2015.

**WorkINdiana (WI) - legacy program (pre-Gov. Holcomb’s Next Level initiative) that helps adults earn their high school equivalency and offers adults aid who are looking to receive certificates in designated growth industries. Launched August 2011.**

**B**USINESS **P**ARTNERSHIP / **E**CONOMIC **F**OCUS

**BUSINESS FOCUS (MI):**

- Most clear connection is for Michigan Reconnect, where the program will connect businesses to qualified candidates.

**BUSINESS FOCUS (TN):**

- Reconnect website provides a portal to “Launch My Career Tennessee”. After students select their preferences in major, school, job, and industry, the portal allows students to view

**BUSINESS FOCUS (FL):**

- Complete Florida actively requests partnership from the business community. Complete Florida provides “needs assessments” to companies, to identify training needs and

**BUSINESS FOCUS (IN):**

- Through the NLJ Employer Training Grant, employers who train, hire, and retain new or incumbent workers to fill in-demand positions within recognized job fields are reimbursed

**BUSINESS FOCUS (MS):**

- C2C instead leverages high degree of institutional support and coordination-cooperation between the Mississippi Institutions of Higher Learning (oversight of numbers) to obtain their Associate’s or bachelor’s degree. Adult learners must be 21 years of age and out of college for at least 24 consecutive months. Launched August 2017.

**BUSINESS FOCUS (NV):**

- Highly pro-business: cooperation ensures current degree programs provide the correct education and training for in-demand jobs and strives to create more and new degree programs to fulfill

- The second lacks a formal name but is a coordinated effort between Nevada Industry Excellence (industrial outreach arm of Nevada System for Higher Education), the Governor’s Office of Workforce Innovation (OWINN), the Department of Employment, Training, & Rehabilitation (DETR), and the business community to address the workforce needs of the high demand jobs through education and training.
economic indicators like ROI, estimating how much the student can expect to earn over the next 20 years if they finish their degree, compared to someone who stopped at high school.

- Drive to 55 Alliance is a coalition of private sector partners and community and non-profit leaders organized to support the state’s initiative to reach 55 percent of adults with a post-secondary credential by 2025. It is co-chaired by Nissan and the Tennessee Chamber of Commerce, has twelve employer partners, and 45 business organization members.

- For Complete Florida enrollees, the program also offers MyCareerShines, a career and education planning system. MyCareerShines helps provides individual career assessments, helps students explore career options, and match students' interests/skills to target industries.

- Reconnect - job search/placement.
- MI Opportunity (non-four-year students) - two years debt free community college.
- MI Opportunity (four-year students) - two years of tuition-free community or technical college. State funds cover what is not covered by Federal Pell Grants.

STUDENT COST AND AID

STUDENT COST & AID (MI):
- Reconnect - job search/placement.
- MI Opportunity (non-four-year students) - two years debt free community college.
- MI Opportunity (four-year students) - two years of tuition-free community or technical college. State funds cover what is not covered by Federal Pell Grants.

STUDENT COST & AID (TN):
- Two years of tuition-free community or technical college. State funds cover what is not covered by Federal Pell Grants.

STUDENT COST & AID (FL):
- The application and program are free, and participants receive a Complete Florida coach who helps students from application to graduation. Coach services include help
- skills gaps. Complete Florida also provides "business starter kits" filled with promotional materials to help inform employees about Complete Florida.

STUDENT COST & AID (IN):
- The NLJ Workforce Ready Grant pays all tuition and regularly assessed fees for qualifying high-value certificates. It can be used at any eligible training provider and covers all courses
- Tuition Assistance Grant - assists adult learners pay prior student debt, alleviate the cost of new tuition, and cover ancillary expenses such as textbook costs. $500 award to students each

STUDENT COST & AID (MS):
- Tuition Assistance Grant - assists adult learners pay prior student debt, alleviate the cost of new tuition, and cover ancillary expenses such as textbook costs. $500 award to students each
- Mississippi’s eight public higher-learning institutions), the Mississippi Community College Board (oversight of Mississippi’s fifteen community colleges), Governor Phil Bryant, the Mississippi Department of Human Services (MDHS), the Mississippi Department of Employment Security (MDES), who all partnered to actively identify potential students and create services catered to adult learners.

STUDENT COST & AID (NV):
- Increased opportunities for internships, apprenticeships, and dual enrollment programs which allow high school students to earn college credit and credentials through various programs
year students) - two years tuition assistance.

- finding financial aid assistance, institution / degree program selection, and career counseling.
  - General tuition assistance - Complete Florida offers scholarships. Students are eligible for one scholarship per term. The coach helps the student assess eligibility requirements.
  - Specific tuition assistance - TEACH Early Childhood Scholarship Program and Complete Florida partnered to offer 100 percent funding assistance to adult students finishing their degree in Early Childhood Education, who are currently employed as child care teachers and administrators.

required to satisfy the qualifying program. The grant is available for up to two years.
  - WI covers the tuition and one exam for occupational training that leads to an industry-recognized certificate.

qualifying semester for which they are enrolled in college.
  - Additionally, the C2C application is free, and C2C matches learners with a C2C coach and the institution offering the best pathway to obtain a degree.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TARGET INDUSTRIES (MI):</th>
<th>TBD.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TARGET INDUSTRIES (TN):</td>
<td>Reconnect does not explicitly identify target industries, but the Tennessee Department of Labor &amp; Workforce Development informs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TARGET INDUSTRIES (FL):</td>
<td>High-demand fields are: Business &amp; Management, Education, Healthcare, and Information Technology.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TARGET INDUSTRIES (IN):</td>
<td>Advanced Manufacturing, Building &amp; Construction, Health &amp; Life Sciences, IT &amp; Business Services, and Transportation &amp;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TARGET INDUSTRIES (MS):</td>
<td>Through C2C, adult learners can pursue any degree they like, and the C2C website provides &quot;Connect 2 Careers&quot;, a job</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TARGET INDUSTRIES (NV):</td>
<td>OWINN commissioned a January 2017 report identifying in-demand occupations across eight sectors determined to be</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
that between 2016 and 2026, the following five occupations will endure the largest positive percentage changes in employment: Computer and Mathematical, Healthcare Support, Personal Care & Service, Healthcare Practitioners & Technical, and Business & Financial Operations.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PROGRAM FUNDING SOURCES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>PROGRAM FUNDING (MI):</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• TBD.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PROGRAM FUNDING (TN):</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• First dollars funded through federal Pell grant; last dollars funded by the state via the lottery reserve fund. Programs have cost the state about $45 million annually.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PROGRAM FUNDING (FL):</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• State funding through the education enhancement trust fund, and the general revenue fund.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PROGRAM FUNDING (IN):</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• NLJ - state grants.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• WI - WIOA requires Workforce Development Boards (WDB), in partnership with the local officials, to develop and submit to the state for approval a comprehensive four-year local plan that advances the continuing modernization of the workforce system.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PROGRAM FUNDING (MS):</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Diversified sources: MDHS, MDES, and charitable donations, such as the $3.5 million received from the W.K. Kellogg Foundation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PROGRAM FUNDING (NV):</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Federal WIOA funds, and diversified state sources (Career Enhancement Program, Governor's Reserve, Dislocated Worker Rapid Response, Vocational Rehabilitation).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Logistics.

resources portal to connect employers to those who have recently completed their degree.

currently vital or predictably vital to the Nevada economy: Aerospace & Defense, Construction, Information Technology, Healthcare & Medical Services, Manufacturing & Logistics, Mining & Materials, Natural Resources, and Tourism, Gaming, & Entertainment.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>n/a.</td>
<td>Mixed - Student application numbers far exceeded expectations for both programs. Positive results include Tennessee leading the nation in FAFSA completion rate, higher-than-expected adult enrollment in Reconnect, no new taxes, and no perception of the programs as entitlements (community service required, and programs do not discriminate based on income).</td>
<td>Critiques are scarce but the program still exists today.</td>
<td>NLJ - positive reaction - more than 4,000 individuals enrolled in certificate programs, and more than $5 million reimbursed to employers.</td>
<td>Positive - since August 2017, 864 adult learners enrolled, and 916 degrees have been awarded.</td>
<td>Critiques are scarce but the program has not been salient.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>WI - 6,000 completions and 5,000 certifications (as of November 2018).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**RESPONSE (IN):**
- NLJ - positive reaction - more than 4,000 individuals enrolled in certificate programs, and more than $5 million reimbursed to employers.
- WI - 6,000 completions and 5,000 certifications (as of November 2018).